


CITY OF VALLEJO
OFFICE OF THE FINANCE DIRECTOR

June 13, 2009

TO: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council
FROM: Robert V. Stout, Finance Director 
SUBJECT: STUDY SESSION REGARDING THE REVISED PROPOSED
FISCAL YEAR 2009-2010 GENERAL FUND BUDGET

AGENDA

ITEM: June 13, 2009, Special Meeting Study Session

Attached are the documents for your use in the June 13, 2009, study session.

Attachment A summarizes the proposed expenditures and the net program costs for each department/division of the City for FY 2009-10. Column E of Attachment A presents the current allocation of resources between General Fund programs.

Attachments B and C summarize the Police and Fire Department services that can be provided to the citizens of Vallejo with this level of allocated resources.

This report is an informational item only and does not require the City Council to take any action.

If you have any questions, do not hesitate to contact me at 648-4343.

Attachments:

Attachment A – Net Program Costs FY 2009-10 General Fund Budget

Attachment B – Vallejo Police Department Service Level Analysis

Attachment C – Vallejo Fire Department Factors That Affect Fire Department Response

Net Program Costs

FY 09-10 General Fund

	Gross Costs (Salaries, Services Supplies)	Interfund Allocations	Net Expenditures	Program Revenues	Net Program Costs
	A	B	C	D	E
<u>Public Safety</u>					
Police	27,728,427	(925,169)	26,803,258	(3,844,992)	22,958,266
Fire	18,174,820	(83,700)	18,091,120	(2,521,900)	15,569,220
					<u>38,527,486</u>
<u>Community Development</u>					
Building	1,160,590	-	1,160,590	(1,500,000)	(339,410)
Planning	1,048,633	(150,000)	898,633	(300,000)	598,633
Code Enforcement	706,376	(50,000)	656,376	(533,625)	122,751
Economic Development	1,261,486	(496,826)	764,660	(511,000)	253,660
					<u>635,634</u>
<u>Public Works</u>					
Admin/Engineering Maintenance	3,157,995	(1,913,995)	1,244,000	(1,244,000)	-
Administration	346,855	(346,855)	-	-	-
Public Buildings	1,073,726	(245,196)	828,530	(10,000)	818,530
Streets	1,380,191	(1,069,667)	310,524	(1,000)	309,524
Grounds	658,333	(204,398)	453,935	(108,000)	345,935
Traffic Signs and Signals	931,001	(728,338)	202,663	(10,000)	192,663
Recycling Program	143,800	-	143,800	(143,800)	-
Library	81,581	-	81,581	(30,000)	51,581
Landscape	90,000	-	90,000	(8,000)	82,000
					<u>1,800,233</u>
<u>Non-departmental</u>					
Animal control/sheltering	875,000	-	875,000	-	875,000
Retiree Health-pay as go	3,250,000	-	3,250,000	-	3,250,000
Compensated Absences	1,450,000	-	1,450,000	-	1,450,000
Debt Service Transfers	735,000	-	735,000	-	735,000
Bankruptcy consultants	1,000,000	-	1,000,000	-	1,000,000
Utilities/Water	492,000	-	492,000	-	492,000
Property Tax Admin Fee	425,000	-	425,000	-	425,000
PC Replacement/Licensing	100,000	-	100,000	-	100,000
Vacancy assumption	(500,000)	-	(500,000)	-	(500,000)
Other	892,341	(122,547)	769,794	-	769,794
					<u>8,596,794</u>
<u>Administration</u>					
Legislative	373,884	(170,771)	203,113	-	203,113
Executive/Clerk	1,626,518	(353,389)	1,273,129	-	1,273,129
Legal	1,239,038	(515,097)	723,941	-	723,941
Finance	3,366,402	(1,655,875)	1,710,527	-	1,710,527
Human Resources	796,584	(296,978)	499,606	-	499,606
					<u>4,410,316</u>
	<u>74,065,581</u>	<u>(9,328,801)</u>	<u>64,736,780</u>	<u>(10,766,317)</u>	<u>53,970,463</u>

6/9/09

VALLEJO POLICE DEPARTMENT SERVICE LEVEL ANALYSIS

June 13, 2009

BACKGROUND

As of July 1, 2009, the Vallejo Police Department will employ 114 sworn officers and 35 non-sworn support staff members. **Current budget projections reduce that number by October 1, 2009 to 98 sworn officers and 31 non-sworn employees.** The number of non-sworn employees includes Communications Operators who perform Fire Department dispatching duties.

In 2006, the Department had 153 sworn officers and 65 non-sworn staff members.

While there are no specific "industry standard" staffing ratios, in California it is generally accepted that cities need to employ between 1.0 and 1.5 police officers per 1,000 residents depending on crime hazards and community tolerance for crime and disorder. Some cities are considerably higher -- Oakland, Richmond and Berkeley, for example, are close to 2.0/1,000.

For Vallejo that would be between 120 and 180 sworn officers with 60 to 90 non-sworn support personnel. Factors that indicate the need for higher staffing ratios are:

- A high crime rate. Vallejo is the 6th most violent city in California and has the highest number of violent crimes reported by any city in California in our population range (100,000 to 130,000).
- A high-level of calls for service. The Department receives and processes 325 calls for service per day.
- The level of gun-related violence.
- The presence of crime hazards, including abandoned buildings, abandoned cars, open drug dealing, liquor stores, street gangs, prostitutes, transient hotels and motels.
- A high number of parolees and associated social services. Vallejo has the highest number of parolees of any city in Solano County.
- A high number of registered sex offenders. Vallejo has the highest number of registered sex offenders of any city in Solano County.

- The city is bisected by State highways and "high-speed" streets and parkways.

All of these adverse factors exist in Vallejo. **Therefore, Police Department staffing below 120 officers can only result in an ineffective organization that is unable to deliver basic law enforcement and public safety services.**

Because the Vallejo Police Department always has operated with a small, but well trained and highly educated staff, the impact of reductions are felt quickly and are particularly difficult to make.

Hiring decisions always considered Department needs for specific experience, unique skills and specialized training. Implementation of the current layoff proposals will result in the loss of every officer hired since 2004, taking with them years of training and experience including, but not limited to, drug and narcotics enforcement, homicide investigation, traffic enforcement and investigation, counter-terrorism investigation, crime scene investigation, special weapons and tactics and hostage negotiation. All of these skills will be difficult or impossible to replace. Even if we had the ability to provide the necessary training, we will not have sufficient time to recover lost skills and experience between now and October 1st.

Staffing reductions also will layoff "graduates" of our Police Cadet Program who live in Vallejo, attended local schools and have strong loyalties to the community.

SERVICE LEVELS

Since it is impossible to predict the number and time of receipt of calls for service, the number and nature of critical incidents and the complexity of investigations, the following service level descriptions are based on averages and best case scenarios.

For field service level determinations, calls are dispatched in accordance with the following priorities:

Priority 1 – Immediate danger of injury or loss of life including, shootings and stabbings, injury vehicle collisions, fights involving weapons and in-progress burglaries and robberies.

Priority 2 – Urgent response is needed to prevent the call from escalating to Priority 1 including fights where weapons are accessible, domestic violence, alarms, 9-1-1 hang-up calls and in-progress misdemeanors.

Priority 3 – Calls where there is little danger of escalation, but the circumstances warrant a rapid response. Priority 3 calls include non-injury traffic collisions, prowlers, suspicious persons and petty thefts when a suspect is in custody.

Priority 4 – Cold reports where no emergency exists and no one is in custody.

Priority 5 – Calls that may be deferred to an alternative disposition including mail or on-line reporting.

For any police department to be effective, officers must have approximately 35% of their work-day free from calls for service to engage in crime prevention activities, stop and question suspicious persons, make traffic stops and engage in other preventive patrol activities.

WITH 153 OFFICERS AND 65 SUPPORT STAFF MEMBERS
(142 OFFICERS AVAILABLE FOR GENERAL POLICE SERVICES)

- All 9-1-1 calls are answered within State standards: 90% answered within 10 seconds.
- Officers respond to all Priority 1 calls immediately, Priority 2 calls within a few minutes, Priority 3 calls within approximately 30 minutes and Priority 4 calls within about 1 hour.
- Priority 5 calls are handled promptly and efficiently by non-sworn staff members, cadets or volunteers.
- Officers spend part of their shift making car stops and engaging in crime prevention activities.
- The Department provides community services, including Neighborhood Watch, crime prevention education, and abatement of crime hazards. Community members can attend the Citizens' Police Academy and eventually volunteer their services to the Department.
- Street-corner drug dealing is suppressed, reducing the number of drive-by shootings and homicides.
- Traffic enforcement generally meets recommended standards.
- Detectives investigate all violent crime, all felonies where there are sufficient solvability factors and all misdemeanors where the suspect can be reasonably identified. Investigators respond to serious crimes, especially murders, rapes and robberies at night and on the weekend.
- Full use is made of forensic investigative techniques and all crime scenes are processed using modern techniques and equipment.
- The Police Station is open to the public during the normal workday, nights and some weekends.
- Adequate specialized staff members provide canine support, special weapons and tactics, hostage negotiation and rapid expansion capability

for complex investigations (such as child kidnappings and barricaded suspects).

- Adequate management and supervision is in place 24 hours per day, 7 days per week.
- The Department maintains full membership in the FBI's Joint Terrorism Task Force and other joint enforcement activities.
- Alternative programs for juvenile offenders are available.
- All State-mandates are met.

WITH 124 OFFICERS AND 43 SUPPORT STAFF MEMBERS
(113 OFFICERS AVAILABLE FOR GENERAL POLICE SERVICES)

- Many 9-1-1 calls cannot be answered within State standards: Only about 65% answered within 10 seconds.
- Officers respond to all Priority 1 calls immediately, Priority 2 calls within approximately one hour and Priority 3 calls within several hours.
- Priority 4 and 5 calls are referred to alternative handling unless special or unusual circumstances exist.
- Officers have little time to make car or walking stops or engage in crime prevention activities.
- The Department does not provide community services and is unable to abate most crime hazards.
- Street-corner drug dealing is rampant as Crime Suppression Officers are diverted to assist patrol officers or detectives.
- The level of traffic enforcement is well below recommended standards and traffic officers are frequently diverted from their regular assignments to assist patrol officers.
- Detectives investigate only violent crimes and major property crimes where sufficient solvability factors exist. Investigators respond to homicides only after normal duty hours. Investigative response is limited and the solution rate declines.
- Limited use of made of forensic investigative techniques.
- The Police Station is open to the public only a few hours each day.
- Specialized support staff exists but is not adequate to meet daily needs.
- Management and supervision is limited and supervisors often must respond to calls for service or are diverted from their primary duties to assist field officers.
- The Department cannot maintain membership in joint police activities unless they are revenue producing.
- Juvenile offenders are referred to the County Probation Department.
- Most State-mandates are met.

WITH 98 OFFICERS AND 31 SUPPORT STAFF MEMBERS
(87 OFFICERS AVAILABLE FOR GENERAL POLICE SERVICES)

- Most 9-1-1 calls cannot be answered within State standards: Only about 45% answered within 10 seconds.
- Officers respond to most Priority 1 calls immediately (assuming receipt of one Priority 1 call at a time) and most Priority 2 calls within one hour. Many Priority 2 calls will be reclassified to Priority 3.
- Priority 3, 4 and 5 calls will be referred to alternative handling unless special or unusual circumstances exist.
- Officers have no time to make car or walking stops or engage in crime prevention activities. General patrol is non-existent.
- The Department does not provide community services and crime hazards are not abated.
- Street-corner drug dealing is rampant as Crime Suppression Officers are eliminated.
- Traffic enforcement is well below any reasonable level and traffic officers are needed to assist patrol officers during the major portion of their work day. Traffic safety is diminished and the number and severity of vehicle collisions increases.
- Detectives investigate only homicides and life-threatening criminal activity. No property crimes are investigated and all cases with limited solvability factors are filed. Limited investigative response is provided even for homicides that occur after normal duty hours.
- Forensic investigative techniques are limited to homicides.
- The Police Station is open to the public only a few days each week.
- Specialized support staff (canine, SWAT, etc.) does not exist.
- Patrol shifts may deploy as few as four officers for a portion of the day. Some patrol shifts may be deployed in two-officer units to avoid placing officers in dangerous situations without adequate assistance.
- Most arrestees will be cited and released and not booked at the County Jail.
- Participating in joint activities is totally dependent upon cost reimbursement. Access to valuable information resources is lost.
- The Department cannot meet State-mandated training requirements.

OTHER FACTORS TO CONSIDER

Employee Flight – Officers will not wait until October to see if they are going to be laid off. Vallejo's experienced and educated police officers are valued by other agencies, many of which have already started recruiting efforts.

Police Cadets – The Police Cadet Program will likely not survive another round of budget cuts since program participants no longer will have any opportunity to attend the Police Academy or become Vallejo Police Officers.

Vallejo Fire Department

Factors That Affect Fire Department Response

Fire Department Industry Standards

- Body of regulations regarding the fire service provide that if fire services are provided at all, they must be done so with the safety of the firefighters and citizens in mind.
- Overall challenge for the City – design fire services within fiscal constraints that limit the City’s ability to staff, training and equip a safe and effective fire/medical response force.
- Art of fire company deployment – companies with all risk intervention units strategically located in a community for quick response to keep emergencies small with positive outcomes.
- Departments must assemble enough Firefighters in a reasonable period in order to control the emergency without it escalating to greater alarms.
- If companies arrive too late or total personnel sent to the emergency are too few for the emergency type, they are drawn into a losing and more dangerous battle.
- Insurance Services Office (ISO) Fire Department Grading Schedule would like to see first due engines stations spaced 1.5 miles apart and ladder trucks spaced 2.5 miles apart.

Vallejo’s Unique Characteristics

- Citygate 2006 report – Vallejo’s call for service volume his higher than typical “bedroom” suburban community
- Vallejo is not a typical outer Bay Area suburban area comprised of mostly single family homes with a modest fire and emergency medical workload demand.
- Vallejo is larger than many suburban cities and is much more diverse in building types and population socioeconomics.
- Vallejo is much more of a small “city” than suburb.
- City has traditionally provided fire services commensurate with its risks and for outcomes closer to urban Bay Area and national best practice expectations.

- Closure of the two fire stations has moved the fire department's capability closer to that of a small suburban town where desirable outcomes are only typically achieved close to fire stations and where calls for services do not occur in groups, but more one at a time.
- Even with 8 fire station districts – given the hilly terrain and non grid design curvilinear streets outside the downtown, most of the City cannot be covered by a first due unit in a desirable 4 minute travel time. There are just not enough fire stations (without any closures) to meet this best practice goal for urban-suburban areas.
- Vallejo has a relatively high quantity of structure fires for a community its population size.

Effects of Closing Fire Stations (Two)

- Every fire station district experienced decayed performance as workload was shifted to the remaining companies.
- 39% of the time – simultaneous calls for service with two calls open. During these periods Vallejo would not have enough Firefighters available to field a prompt effective structure fire attack. Additional station closures would make this a common daily occurrence.
- Since closure – 19% of citywide total calls were moved to second due fire companies.
- If fire service response is to achieve positive outcomes in severe EMS situations and incipient fire situations, all companies must arrive, size up the situation and deploy effective measures before brain damage or death occurs or the fire spreads beyond the room of origin.
- Probable that City cannot maintain performance required in Public/Private Partnership Agreement with County EMS Agency –as more stations close.
- If three (3) minutes are added to citywide average travel time:
 - Total response time for the first unit is 11.10 minutes, well beyond the range of survival for a patient in cardiac arrest.
 - If a fire is openly burning in a room when 911 was called, with a first unit on scene at the 11th minute and the balance of the multiple units needed arriving by the 15th minute – the fire will have taken the room of origin to complete involvement and will have spread to adjoining rooms, the walls and attic spaces. The structure will likely be lost to the fire and victims who could not self evacuate will not be saved.

These outcomes are commonly called an “exposure” level of effort as the fire

department may not save the structure of origin, but can probably keep the fire from spreading to adjoining structures. Patients with immediate life threatening emergencies may not be saved.

Truck Company Staffing

- The City needs to recognize in its fire deployment planning where significant life hazard, tax and employer generators are located to ensure an effective response force can arrive quickly enough at these higher risk sites.

- Federal & State OSHA regulations on firefighters working in hazardous conditions require teams of two. With a three person Truck Company, an engine company has to be combined with a second Engine Company at serious fires for dangerous operations. This affects task time completion at the emergency and requires an additional engine to be sent to the emergency, further straining a city system with lower staffing and one that experiences a call for service simultaneous rate of 39 percent for two calls being open.

- Given the 11 multi story buildings in Vallejo, the age of some of these buildings, the fact that some are residential and not sprinklered, all lead to the finding that the Vallejo Fire Department needs the timely response of a ladder truck and crew.

Mutual Aid Coverage Impact

- Communities will often justify their service reductions assuming that their neighbors will respond via the California and County mutual aid system.

- California Master Fire Mutual Aid Agreement says that an agency sends resources on a “can do so” basis – not a “should” or “must” basis.

- Before a community sends resources out of town, they must cover their own emergencies, as well as handle the associated costs by helping another community.

- California does not reimburse mutual aid help on a local, county or agency basis. These costs are borne by local government and are expected to level out across the agencies over the years.

- California reimburses for mutual aid when disasters are declared and the fire goes well beyond a county's day-to-day ability to handle it.
- Vallejo is to some degree captive to its geographic location. It is not surrounded by developed land and multiple fire departments. Only two, much smaller fire departments directly adjoin Vallejo – American Canyon and Benicia.
- When American Canyon and Benicia Fire Departments are available to respond, they are too far away to be of immediate value for an initial attack on a serious fire and do not meet EMS system response time needs to the cover of Vallejo.
- Vallejo should see these units as “greater alarm” support on serious fires or backfill support during period of simultaneous emergencies.
- Mutual aid units just are not available in time or quantity to replace Vallejo units.
- If fire service reductions in Vallejo caused high mutual aid responses into Vallejo, it is entirely reasonable that these agencies could determine the relationship was no longer mutual.

Conclusion

- Closure of Stations 22 and 27 have seriously reduced the performance of a department that was already stretched to provide positive outcomes in severe emergencies that occurred further from the stations due to Vallejo's challenging topography, road network and size.
- Further reductions will not change the fact that the overall deployment in the City has fallen to that only capable of a defensive, protect the exposed buildings outcome based firefighter effort – not an offensive, interior based operation.
- Medical patients with immediately life-threatening emergencies at the time 911 is called, will not be saved if their location is not near a remaining fire unit.