

AGENDA

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY OF VALLEJO September 8, 2008 5:15 P.M.

CHAIR Marc Fox

COMMISSIONERS

Frank Jackson Donald Jordan Connie Klimisch Michael Preovolos

CITY HALL
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
555 Santa Clara Street
Valleio. CA 94590

RULES OF CONDUCT FOR ADDRESSING THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION: Complete a "Request to Address the Civil Service Commission" card for any item listed on the agenda that you wish to discuss. After receiving recognition from the Chairperson please walk to the rostrum, state your name and address, and proceed to comment upon the agenda item you wish to discuss. No member of the audience will be called upon to address the Civil Service Commission on any subject during the time the members are discussing the item. Following the discussion and prior to a vote, the Chairperson will recognize any member of the audience who wishes to speak on the subject.

Requests for disability modifications or accommodations, aids or services may be made by a person with a disability to the Department of Human Resources no less than 72 hours prior to the meeting as required by Section 202 of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 and the federal rules and regulations adopted in implementation thereof. The Department of Human Resources may be contacted as follows:

Telephone: (707) 553-7211, FAX: (707) 648-5292 or e-mail: llofton@ci.vallejo.ca.us

- 1. CALL TO ORDER
- 2. FLAG SALUTE
- 3. ROLL CALL
- 4. ELECTION OF SECRETARY (PURSUANT TO RULE 2.2, OFFICERS AND ELECTIONS, OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION RULES AND REGULATIONS)
- 5. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS
 - A. RECRUITMENT AND CLASSIFICATION REPORT
- 6. EXECUTIVE SECRETARY'S REPORT
- 7. REPORT OF CHAIRPERSON AND COMMISSIONERS
- 8. COMMUNITY FORUM

Those wishing to address the Commission on any matter for which another opportunity to speak is not provided on the Agenda but which is within the jurisdiction of the Commission to resolve may come forward to the podium during the "Community Form" portion of the Agenda. The Community Forum shall be limited to three minutes per individual and five minutes for individuals representing groups.

9. PUBLIC COMMENT REGARDING CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

10. CONSENT CALENDAR

All matters are approved under one motion unless requested to be removed for discussion by the Chairperson or Executive Secretary.

- A. APPROVAL OF AGENDA
- B. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING HELD AUGUST 11, 2008
- C. APPROVAL OF THE REGISTER OF ELIGIBLES FOR COMMUNICATIONS OPERATOR I
 - 1) Communications Operator I
 - 2) Housing Accounting Specialist
 - 3) Treatment Plant Operator III/IV
- D. CHANGE IN EXAMINATION PLAN FOR UTILITY MECHANIC CLASSIFICATION

The Human Resources Department has received a new request to conduct a recruitment for the classification of Utility Mechanic. Currently, the examination plan for Utility Mechanic consists of a written test (weighted 50%) and an appraisal interview by an Oral Board (weighted 50%.) These components and weights were approved by the Commission in November 2007 at staff's request. A recent review of the test outcomes using this changed exam plan has raised concerns with staff and the hiring department's managers concerning its validity, reliability, and effectiveness in assessing candidates' qualifications accurately.

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u>: Approve changes to the examination plan for the classification of Utility Mechanic.

- 11. NEW BUSINESS
- 12. OLD BUSINESS
- 13. COMMUNITY FORUM
- 14. ADJOURNMENT

CITY OF VALLEJO - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT RECRUITMENT/CLASSIFICATION REPORT

| 2000 | ¢ | |
|------|----|---|
| Č | | |
| Č | | |
| ē | ` | |
| ` | | |
| - | , | |
| 0 | Ċ | |
| | | |
| 4 | _ | |
| | 7 | |
| 1 | _ | |
| 5 | 7 | • |
| ï | = | |
| 4 | 1 | ۱ |
| | _ | ۱ |
| r- | , | |
| 7 | | |
| C | | Ì |
| _ | _ | |
| U | ۲. | |
| 00 | 1 | ١ |
| | _ | • |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |

CLASSIFICATION STATUS

| | 8/21/08 - DEBORA MET WITH LIV ON GO OVER OUTCOME. 7/15/08 - MTG WITH SANDY AND LIV ON 7/16 TO DISCUSS OUTCOME. 7/2/08 - RECEIVED FINAL REPORT FROM CPS. 6/23 - RECEIVED A DRAFT REPORT FROM CPS, DEB WILL REVIEW WITH SANDY. 6/4 - CPS PROJECT MGR. CONDUCTE |
|--------------|---|
| | Z L |
| | IV C |
| | D I |
| | A C |
| | NEI VEI |
| | CELA |
| | H S RE |
| | М М |
| | 0.79 12.00 12.00 13.00 10.00 1 |
| | PS. OJ |
| | M C R |
| S | ROI CPS |
| COMMENTS | 3. 7 TF |
| | Q SMI |
| È | DY REI |
| 5 | AL AL |
| ٥ | H N H |
| | O CE M |
| COMMENT | 8/21/08 - DEBORA MET WITH LIV ON GO OVER OUTCOME. 7/15/08 - MTG WITH SANDY AND LIV ON TO DISCUSS OUTCOME. 7/2/08 - RECEIVED FINAL REPORT FROM CPS. 6/23 - RECEIVED A DRAFT REPORT FROM CPS, DEB WILL REVIEW WITH SANDY. 6/4 - CPS PROJECT MGR. CONDUCTE |
| | NE E |
| | - R - A |
| | 11 H T |
| | WIT 7/7. B W |
| | ME |
| | S C Z |
| | \$ 2 X |
| | SS C |
| | T F |
| | 00 Sign |
| | %21 TO REF |
| 12 | VE 8/2 TC RE |
| STAFF | மு |
| Ĭ, | > |
| 0,2 | |
| | |
| 0 2 | |
| 5 5 1 | |
| RE | 200 |
| | |
| | PERSONNEL TECH RECLASS |
| | |
| | |
| | SS |
| Z | Z. |
| | REC |
| , Y , | E I |
| FIC | Ĕ |
| LASSIFICATIO | ERSONNEL TECH RECLAS |
| AS. | N N |
| 1 B | RSC |
| | PE |
| | |
| | |
| ь | |
| Ä | HR |
| JP.4 | Ħ |
| | |

| PW-CY | CUSTOMER SERVICE REP | CP 8/18/08 - ASSIGNED TO CPS, THEY ARE REVIEWING SPEC NOW. 6/23/08 - JOHN WILL HAVE JADE |
|-------|----------------------|--|
| | | RESUBMIT TO REVIEW NEW ASSIGNED DUTIES. 3/24- MTG W/ CERINI WHO IS UNCERTAIN ABOUT THE |
| | | IR AND LET US KNOW HOW TO PROCEED. |
| | | |

Page 1 of 3

CITY OF VALLEJO - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT RECRUITMENT/CLASSIFICATION REPORT AS OF August 29, 2008

| | COMMENTS | RECRUITMENT OPENED FRIDAY, AUGUST 22, 2008. ADVERTISEMENT SENT TO VALLEJO TIMES HERALD WHO DID NOT RUN IT IN SUNDAY'S PAPER AS REQUESTED. SO, IT WILL NEED TO RUN NEXT SUNDAY | 7/21/08 - SCHEDULED MTG WITH CAPT. JACKSON TO DISCUSS LOGISTICS AND TEST LOCATIONS. 6/30/08 - NOTIFIED CAPT JACKSON THAT WE RECVID 16 APPLICATIONS. 6/3 - POSTED JA WITH A FFD OF 6/27. | | |
|--------------------|-----------------------------|---|---|--|-----------------------------|
| | DATE OF EXAM | | | | N/A |
| | EXAM | 9/16/08 PROMO/OPEN | ASSESSMENT CENTER | | N/A |
| 1 010 | FFD | 80/91/6 | 6/27/08 | | |
| | OPEN | 8/20/08 | 6/2/08 | CONTIN | CONTIN |
| 2008 | STAFF | TB | VE | ГМ | ΓM |
| August 29, 2008 | DATE FINAL RECIEPT | 5/20/08 | | | |
| Au | DATE OF FINAL SIGN | 5/20/08 | | | |
| AS OF | DATE SENT TO FIN | 5/20/2008 | | | |
| | DATE SIGNED BY HR | 5/20/2008 | | | |
| | DATE REQ RECD | 39588 | | The state of the s | |
| | REQ# | 2008-009 | 0 | N/A | N/A |
| TUS | # OF VAC | 3 | 1 | 1 | _ |
| RECRUITMENT STATUS | POSITION | CUSTOMER SERVICE REPRESENTATIV E | POLICE | POLICE OFFICER (LATERAL ENTRY) | POLICE CADET (PART-TIME) |
| RECRUI | DEPART | NIE | PD | PD | PD |

Page 2 of 3

CITY OF VALLEJO - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT RECRUITMENT/CLASSIFICATION REPORT AS OF August 29, 2008

| | COMMENTS | | | NEXT WRITTEN EXAM TENTATIVELY SCHEDULED FOR OCTOBER 21, 2008. | 8/27/08 - POSITION POSTED IIV (AFTER REVIEW OF DATA BY JAMES GRAJKOWSKI) IN NEOGOV AND EMAILED TO ALL 8/15/08 - ASSIGNED TO PAMELA FROM RGS. 8/8/08 - WILL ASSIGN TO RGS. 3/14 - CERINI AGREED TO PLACE ON HOLD UNTIL 4/22. |
|--------------------|-----------------------------|---|---------------------|---|--|
| | DATE OF EXAM | N/A | N/A | | ORAL TENTATIV E 9/23/08 |
| | EXAM TYPE | N/A | N/A | OPEN | ORAL |
| | FFD | | | | 9/12/08 |
| | OPEN | CONTIN. | CONTIN. | CONT | 08/27/08 |
| | STAFF | ГМ | ГМ | LM | FI |
| August 29, 2008 | DATE FINAL RECIEPT | | | | 12/20/07 |
| | DATE OF FINAL SIGN | | | | 12/20/07 |
| AS OF | DATE SENT TO FIN | | | | 11/19/07 |
| | DATE SIGNED BY HR | | | | 11/19/07 |
| | DATE REQ RECD | | | | 39400 |
| | REQ# | N/A | N/A | N/A | 2007-55 |
| TUS | # OF VAC | (| | | |
| RECRUITMENT STATUS | POSITION | COMM OPERATOR II (PERMANENT- INTERMITTENT) | COMM OPERATOR II | COMM OPERATOR I | PUBLIC WORKS SUPERVISOR/ST REETS 20% GF, 80% NGF |
| RECRUI | DEPART | PD | PD | PD | PW-CY |

CITY OF VALLEJO - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT RECRUITMENT/CLASSIFICATION REPORT AS OF August 29, 2008

RECRUITMENT STATUS

| | COMMENTS | THIS PROMOTIONAL OPPORTUNITY WAS OPENED TO QUALIFIED, ELIGIBLE CITY EMPLOYEES ON FRIDAY, AUGUST 22, 2008. AN E-MAIL ALERTING EMPLOYEES OF THIS OPPORTUNITY WAS SENT TO ALL CITY EMPLOYEES THAT AFTERNOON. | THIS POSITION OPENED AS A PROMOTIONAL OPPORTUNITY ON FRIDAY, AUGUST 22, 2008. AN E-MAIL ALERTING CITY EMPLOYEES OF THIS OPPORTUNITY WAS SENT FRIDAY AFTERNOON TO ALL EMPLOYEES. | 6/19/08 - REQUISITION CLOSURE VERIFIED. 6/17/08 - LIV WILL SEND AN EMAIL TO NOTIFY CLOSURE OF REQUISITION. 6/23/08 - REQ. # 2008-11 FILLED WITH TPO I. 5/12/08 - REQ. #2007- 33 FILLED WITH RIF. 4/8/08 - WAITING FOR IBEW LAYOFFS TO CONCLUDE. |
|-----|-----------------------------|---|---|---|
| | DATE OF EXAM | ORAL THIS OPPR QUA EMP AUE | THIS PRO ON I AN I EMP OPPU FRIE EMP | 6/19/ VER VER SEN CLO 6/23/ 6/23/ 33 FI WAI |
| | EXAM | РКОМО | РКОМО | N/A - UNASSEMBLE D |
| | FFD | 80/80/6 | 80/60/6 | CONT. |
| | OPEN DATE | 8/20/08 | 8/20/08 | CONT. |
| | STAFF | TB | TB | ГМ |
| , D | DATE FINAL RECIEPT | 1/03/08 | 06/26/08 | |
| (| DATE OF FINAL SIGN | 1/7/08 | 06/25/08 | |
| 2 | DATE SENT TO FIN | 12/27/07 | 06/25/08 | |
| | DATE SIGNED BY HR | 12/27/07 | 06/25/08 | |
| | DATE REQ RECD | 39437 | 39619 | |
| | REQ# | 2007-57 | 2008-19 | |
| | N # OF VAC | NR - | 0 | TI |
| | POSITION TITLE | UTILITY SUPERVISOR | SR. PIPE MECHANIC | TREATMENT PLANT OPERATOR III/IV |
| | DEPART | PW-CY | PW-CY | PW- WATER |

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY OF VALLEJO 555 SANTA CLARA STREET VALLEJO, CA 94590

MINUTES

August 11, 2008

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Fox called the meeting to order at 5:15 p.m.

2. FLAG SALUTE

3. ROLL CALL

Present:

Commissioners Fox, Jackson, Jordan, Klimisch* and Preovolos

Staff:

Debora Boutte, Human Resources Operations Manager

Lydia Lofton, Executive Secretary Vivian Evans, Personnel Analyst II John Nagel, Assistant City Attorney

4. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS

A. RECRUITMENT AND CLASSIFICATION REPORT

5. EXECUTIVE SECRETARY'S REPORT

A. Ms. Boutte reported that commissioner interviews have been tentatively scheduled for August 19, 2008. She also introduced Teresa Bryerton, Consultant, who will be working to fill Water Division vacancies.

6. REPORT OF CHAIRPERSON AND COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Preovolos advised that unable to attend the September 8, 2008 meeting.

7. COMMUNITY FORUM

None

8. PUBLIC COMMENT REGARDING CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

None

^{*} Commissioner Klimisch arrived at 5:16 p.m.

9. CONSENT CALENDAR

It was moved by Commissioner Jackson and seconded by Commissioner Klimisch to approve the Consent Calendar.

- A. APPROVAL OF AGENDA
- B. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING HELD AUGUST 11, 2008
- C. APPROVAL OF THE REGISTERS OF ELIGIBLES FOR CIVIL SERVICE POSITIONS:
 - 1) Reservoir Keeper
 - 2) Tree Maintenance Worker
- D. APPROVAL TO REINSTATE MARIA RAINWATER TO THE REGISTER OF ELIGIBLES FOR HOUSING SPECIALIST I/II

The Consent Calendar was approved by the following vote:

AYES:

Commissioners Fox, Jackson, Jordan, Klimisch and Preovolos

NOES:

10. NEW BUSINESS

None

11. OLD BUSINESS

None

12. COMMUNITY FORUM

None

13. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 5:18 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lydia Lofton

Executive Secretary

CITY OF VALLEJO CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REGISTER OF ELIGIBLES

1 - Applicant w/ passing score 1 - On Register

| CLASSIFICATION: | COMMUNICATION | NS OPERATOR I | |
|--|--|--|--|
| REGISTER TYPE: | CONTINUOUS | | |
| REGISTER EXPIRES: | September 8, 2010 | | |
| DATE OF APPROVAL: | September 8, 2008 | | |
| Page 1 of 1 ************************************ | ************************************** | ************************************** | |
| Rondone, Gina | 74.94 | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| Established in accordance wi | | ules and Regulations. APPROVED BY COMMISSION | |
| lyen & South | | | |
| DATE: 9-3-08 | | DATE: | |

CITY OF VALLEJO CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REGISTER OF ELIGIBLES 193 - Applicants

83 - Met MQs/Invited to written exam

28 - Passed written exam/Invited to oral board

20 - Passed oral board/On Register

CLASSIFICATION:

HOUSING ACCOUNTING SPECIALIST

REGISTER TYPE:

OPEN

REGISTER EXPIRES:

SEPTEMBER 8, 2009

DATE OF APPROVAL:

SEPTEMBER 8, 2008

Page 1 of 1

| NAMES | SCORES | VETERANS POINTS |
|----------------------|--------|-----------------|
| | | INCLUDED |
| Byron, Gregory | 83.00 | |
| Steele, Lynnette | 80.25 | |
| Gumbs-Campbell, Noel | 80.08 | |
| Davis, William | 78.50 | |
| Brown, Hope | 78.33 | |
| Henderson, William | 78.17 | |
| Robinson, Ericka | 78.17 | |
| Denham, Michael | 76.54 | |
| Ross, Stacey | 75.29 | |
| Shieh, Michael | 75.29 | |
| Her, Yeng | 74.75 | |
| Taylor, Ursula | 74.54 | |
| Smith, Darlene | 74.29 | |
| Dau, Christine | 74.17 | |
| Aguilar, Carina | 74.04 | |
| Cunningham, Kimberly | 73.79 | |
| Miller, Brenda | 72.42 | |
| Richards, Kenya | 72.13 | |
| Lewis, Adrianna | 72.08 | |
| Vito, Noemi | 71.38 | |
| | | |

| Established in accordance with the Civil Service Ri | ules and Regulations. |
|---|------------------------|
| REVIEWED BY EXECUTIVE SECRETARY | APPROVED BY COMMISSION |

| QNo | n N. Bouth | | |
|-------|------------|-------|-------------|
| DATE: | 9-3-0 | DATE: | |

CITY OF VALLEJO CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REGISTER OF ELIGIBLES 16 - Applicants 1 - Met MQs/On Register

| CLASSIFICATION: | TREATMENT PLA | NT OPERATOR III/IV |
|---|--|---|
| REGISTER TYPE: | CONTINUOUS | |
| REGISTER EXPIRES: | September 8, 2010 | |
| DATE OF APPROVAL: | September 8, 2008 | |
| Page 1 of 1 ************************************ | ************************************** | ************** |
| Kimbro, Terry | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| Established in accordance v REVIEWED BY EXECUT | | Rules and Regulations. APPROVED BY COMMISSION |
| Jetera d Secu | th | |
| DATE: 9-3-08 | | DATE: |

CITY OF VALLEJO HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT

Agenda Item

Civil Service Commission

Date: September 8, 2008

TO:

Civil Service Commission

FROM:

Debora Boutte, Human Resources Operations Manager
Teresa Bryerton, Consultant

SUBJECT:

Change in Examination Plan for Utility Mechanic Classification

RECOMMENDATION

Approve changes to the examination plan for the classification of Utility Mechanic as outlined herein.

SUMMARY

The Human Resources Department has received a new request to conduct a recruitment for the classification of Utility Mechanic. Currently, the examination plan for Utility Mechanic consists of a written test (weighted 50%) and an appraisal interview by an Oral Board (weighted 50%.) These components and weights were approved by the Commission in November 2007 at staff's request. A recent review of the test outcomes using this changed exam plan has raised concerns with staff and the hiring department's managers concerning its validity, reliability, and effectiveness in assessing candidates' qualifications accurately.

BACKGROUND AND DISCUSSION

Last November staff requested, and the Commission approved, an exam plan change from an appraisal interview (weighted 100%) to the current exam plan. In making its previous case to the Commission, staff noted that an appraisal interview by an Oral Board was insufficient in determining whether candidates possessed the required skills, knowledge, and abilities to perform the duties of the Utility Mechanic class. It was believed that a written test would better enable the City to identify those candidates whose basic skill sets were most closely matched with the needs of the positions in this class.

Since its approval, the Human Resources Department has administered one open/competitive recruitment and selection process for Utility Mechanic. This process incorporated the changed exam plan. It resulted in only three names appearing on the Register of Eligibles. Staff recognizes that the applicant pool of qualified individuals with the required skill sets is necessarily limited; both because these skills are in high demand, and because the City's ability to pay the market rate for these skills is checked by fiscal realities. However, in preparation for the newly requested recruitment for this classification, staff and the hiring department's managers have discussed the content of the written test that has now been administered, along with the initial screening of application materials, and the ongoing use of appraisal interviews by Oral Boards.

Based on those discussions, staff and the hiring managers have now determined that the written test obtained did not significantly and reliably test the knowledge, skills, and abilities of candidates as

CITY OF VALLEJO HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT

Agenda Item

Civil Service Commission

Date: September 8, 2008

those relate to the actual duties assigned to the class. In fact, it was concluded that the act of administering a written test for this examination process likely eliminated qualified candidates who are not skilled at taking written tests. Additionally, appraisal interviews by Oral Boards test, to a great extent, communication and interpersonal skills. As Utility Mechanic positions have limited communication with other staff and no public interactions, the current structure of the appraisal interviews by an Oral Board may be resulting in the disqualification of still other qualified candidates.

Staff and the hiring department managers have agreed that the best test instruments for assessing the qualifications of Utility Mechanic candidates may be either a performance (demonstration of job skills) test, by itself, or a combination of a performance test with a specifically structured appraisal interview by an Oral Board. The performance test options discussed include a (1) strictly hands-on demonstration by candidates at a job site in the City where the duties of a Utility Mechanic are typically utilized; (2) a specially structured performance test/appraisal interview with an Oral Board; or (3) a combination of #1 and #2.

Staff is requesting that the Commission establish an examination plan that includes the above three options allowing the Executive Secretary to implement any one or combination of the exam plan options at each new recruitment for this classification. The Executive Secretary would set the relative weights and pass points of each portion and the total exam thereof. This flexibility will ensure that the Executive Secretary can adapt the examinations to the then existing needs of the city for positions in this classification.

Staff has discussed the possible change to the examination plan with the immediate supervisor of this position, the division head, and the president of the appropriate union, IBEW (International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers), Local 2376, AFL-CIO. All those contacted concur with staff that the flexibility requested for experimenting with the combination of test components is appropriate for this classification. Therefore, staff recommends approval of the above-referenced changes to the Utility Mechanic examination plan.

Authority to take Action

Authority for the Commission's action is in Rule 9.4 and 9.5. Open Competitive Examinations, Control of Examination and Relative Weights, which states:

Rule 9.1, "The Commission shall determine and fix the nature and content of the examinations including any physical agility tests."

PREPARED BY: Teresa Bryerton, Consultant

CONTACT: Teresa Bryerton, Consultant (707) 649-4852

J:\CSC Reports\09-08-08 UtiltymechexamplanChange.doc